IN THE UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT FOR THE WESTERN DISTRICT OF PENNSYLVANIA

KARL E. GARY, OSCAR R. IAMS; SHIRLEY J. IAMS; CHARLES W. PHILLIPS; DAVID HIGGENBOTHAM, JUDITH HIGGENBOTHAM; MARY ANN NEELY; CHARLES AMBROSE WHITLATCH, JR.; DEBRA ANN WHITLATCH, WHITLATCH; DONALD WHITLATCH; FRANCIS E.WHITLATCH; HENRY ABNER WHITLATCH; NORMA JEAN WHITLATCH; ROBERT PHILLIPS; WILLIAM H. WHITLATCH; KATHY L. WHITLATCH; ALFRED S. CHAMBERS AS POWER OF ATTORNEY FOR GARY J. PIERSON, ALFRED R. CHAMBERS, JR.; ALFRED R. CHAMBERS AS POWER OF ATTORNEY FOR WINIFRED J. PIERSON; PAUL R. PHILLIPS; BARBARA SWARTZMILLER; CHARLES E. WHITLATCH; PATRICIA WHITLATCH; NETTIE PHILLIPS) MORRIS; EDNA PHILLIPS SCHRADER; VIRGINÍA KENNEDY; HELEN KELLY; MARY THORNE; and KENNETH L. PHILLIPS,

Plaintiffs,

v.

THE BRADDOCK CEMETERY, AND CONSOL ENERGY, the successor and/or assign of RHEINBRAUN, U.S. CORPORATION; and CNX COAL, the successor and/or assign of CONSOL PENNSYLVANIA COAL COMPANY;

Defendants.

2:05cv1438 Electronic Filing

Judge Cercone Magistrate Judge Caiazza

MEMORANDUM ORDER

This case was filed on October 17, 2005 (Doc. 1). On November 3, 2005, it was referred to United States Magistrate Judge Francis X. Caiazza (Doc. 2) for pretrial proceedings in accordance with the Magistrates Act, 28 U.S.C. §§ 636(b)(1)(A) and (B), and Rules 72.1.3 and 72.1.4 of the Local Rules for Magistrates.

On June 10, 2008, the magistrate judge issued a Report and Recommendation (Doc. 68) recommending that the Defendants'

Motions for Sanctions pursuant to Fed. R. Civ. P. 11 (Docs. 38 and 44) be granted, to the extent described in the Report.

Service of the Report and Recommendation was made, and Defendant Braddock Cemetery (Doc. 69) Consol (Doc. 70) filed objections on June 26, 2008. Plaintiffs filed a Response to Defendants' Objections on July 2, 2008 (Doc. 71).

After a de novo review of the pleadings and documents in the case, together with the Report and Recommendation and the objections thereto, the following Order is entered:

> David Stewart Cercone United States District Judge

Allorione

cc: Honorable Francis X. Caiazza
Chief United States Magistrate Judge

Louis M. Tarasi, Jr., Esquire C. William Kenny, Esquire Tarasi, Tarasi & Fishman 510 Third Avenue Pittsburgh, PA 15219 Paul A. Manion, Esquire Manion, McDonough & Lucas 600 Grant Street Suite 1414 Pittsburgh, PA 15219

Rodger L. Puz, Esquire Dickie, McCamey & Chilcote Two PPG Place Suite 400 Pittsburgh, PA 15222-5402

Joseph A. Katarincic, Esquire Jerri Ann Ryan, Esquire Thorp, Reed & Armstrong 301 Grant Street One Oxford Centre, 14th Floor Pittsburgh, PA 15222-4895